



taught by Rabbi Jeremy Winaker



# Agenda for March 13, 2021

- I. Welcome
- II. Favorite texts from the class
- III. Two Homes
  - A. Together
    - 1. Text
    - 2. Family
  - B. Apart
- IV. What can/should give?
  - A. North America
  - B. Israel
- V. Our at-homeness
- VI. Between Now and “Sometime Soon”
  - A. Recommended Materials
  - B. Recommended Continuity



# Syllabus

## Part I: Stories of Jewish Peoplehood

Unit 1: From No Home to Two Homes

Unit 2: Judaism of Being

Unit 3: Judaism of Becoming

Unit 4: On Universalism and Particularism

## Part II: Contemporary Challenges to Jewish Peoplehood

Unit 5: Between Nationalism, Ultra-Nationalism, and Fascism

Unit 6: Moral Implications of Jewish Nationalism

Unit 7: Israel's Nation-State Law: Ramifications for a Jewish and Democratic State

Unit 8: Antisemitism as a Divisive Force

Unit 9: Antisemitism and Anti-Zionism

Unit 10: The Accusation and Dilemma of Dual Loyalties

Unit 11: "What's Good for the Jews?" Identity Politics in North America

## Part I: Jewish Peoplehood

January 9: Introduction From No Home to Two Homes

January 16: Judaism as Ethics *and* Beliefs  
(Units 2 & 3)

January 23: On Universalism and Particularism

## Part II: Challenges to Jewish Peoplehood

February 13: Nationalism  
(Units 5, 6, & 7)

February 20: Antisemitism  
(Units 8 & 9)

February 27: Dual Loyalties and Identity Politics  
(Units 10 & 11)



# Syllabus (cont.)

## Part III: New Relationship Models for Jewish Peoplehood

Unit 12: From Family to Consumer

Unit 13: Shared Believers, Partners, and Investors

Unit 14: At-Homeness

## Part III: New Models of Peoplehood

March 6: Models to Consider  
(Units 12 & 13)

March 13: At-Homeness

# *Our iEngage Journey*

1. From No Homes to Two Homes

2. Judaism of Being vs Becoming

3. Universalism and Particularism

4. Nationalism

5. Anti-Semitism

6. Dual Loyalty & Identity Politics

7. New Relationship Models

8. Conclusion: At-Homeness



## Genesis 12:1-3

(1) The LORD said to Abram, “Go forth from your native land and from your father’s house to the land that I will show you. (2) I will make of you a great nation, And I will bless you; I will make your name great, And you shall be a blessing. (3) I will bless those who bless you And curse him that curses you; And all the families of the earth Shall bless themselves by you.”(4) Abram went forth as the LORD had commanded him, and Lot went with him. Abram was seventy-five years old when he left Haran. (5) Abram took his wife Sarai and his brother’s son Lot, and all the wealth that they had amassed, and the persons that they had acquired in Haran; and they set out for the land of Canaan.

## בראשית י"ב:א'-ג'

(א) וַיֹּאמֶר ה' אֶל־אַבְרָם לֵךְ־לְךָ מֵאֶרֶץ  
וּמִמּוֹלַדְתְּךָ וּמִבֵּית אָבִיךָ אֶל־הָאֲרֶץ אֲשֶׁר אֲרָאָךְ:  
(ב) וְאַעֲשֶׂה לְגוֹי גָדוֹל וְאַבְרַכְךָ וְאַגְדֹּלְהָ שְׁמִי וְהָיָה  
בְּרָכָה: (ג) וְאַבְרַכְהָ מְבַרְכֶיהָ וּמְקַלְלָהָ אֶאָר וְנִבְרַכְוּ  
בָךְ כָּל מִשְׁפַּחַת הָאָדָמָה: (ד) וַיִּלְךְ אַבְרָם כַּאֲשֶׁר  
דִּבֶּר אֱלֹהֵי ה' וַיִּלְךְ אִתּוֹ לוֹט וְאַבְרָם בֶּן־חַמֶּשׁ  
שָׁנַיִם וְשִׁבְעִים שָׁנָה בְּצֵאתוֹ מִחָרָן: (ה) וַיִּקַּח  
אַבְרָם אֶת־שָׂרִי אִשְׁתּוֹ וְאֶת־לוֹט בֶּן־אָחִיו וְאֶת־  
כָּל־רְכוּשָׁם אֲשֶׁר רָכְשׂוּ וְאֶת־הַנַּפֶּשׁ אֲשֶׁר־עָשׂוּ  
בְּחָרָן וַיֵּצְאוּ לְלֶכֶת אֶרֶץ כְּנָעַן

### Leviticus 19:17-18, 33-34

(17) You shall not hate your brethren in your heart. Reprove your kinsman but incur no guilt because of him. (18) You shall not take vengeance or bear a grudge against your countrymen. Love your fellow as yourself: I am the LORD.

(33) When a stranger resides with you in your land, you shall not wrong him.

(34) The stranger who resides with you shall be to you as one of your citizens; you shall love him as yourself, for you were strangers in the land of Egypt: I the LORD am your God.

ויקרא י"ט: י"ז-י"ח, ל"ג-ל"ד

(יז) לֹא־תִשְׁנֵא אֶת־אָחִיךָ בְּלִבְבְּךָ הוֹכֵחַ תּוֹכִיחֵהוּ אֶת־עַמִּיתְךָ וְלֹא־תִשָּׂא עָלָיו חַטָּא׃  
(יח) לֹא־תִקֶּם וְלֹא־תִטַּר אֶת־בְּנֵי עַמְּךָ וְאַהֲבֵת לְרֵעֶהָ כַּמּוֹךְ אָנִי ה'׃  
(לג) וְכִי־יָגוּר אִתְּךָ גֵר בְּאַרְצְכֶם לֹא תוֹנוּ אֹתוֹ׃ (לד) כַּאֲזַרְח מִכֶּם יִהְיֶה לָכֶם הַגֵּר וְהַגֵּר אִתְּכֶם וְאַהֲבֵת לוֹ כַּמּוֹךְ כִּי־גֵרִים הָיִיתֶם בְּאַרְץ מִצְרַיִם אָנִי ה' אֱלֹהֵיכֶם׃

### Jeremiah 29:4-7

(4) Thus said the LORD of Hosts, the God of Israel, to the whole community which I exiled from Jerusalem to Babylon: (5) Build houses and live in them, plant gardens and eat their fruit. (6) Take wives and beget sons and daughters; and take wives for your sons, and give your daughters to husbands, that they may bear sons and daughters. Multiply there, do not decrease. (7) And seek the welfare of the city to which I have exiled you and pray to the LORD in its behalf; for in its prosperity you shall prosper.

### ירמיהו כ"ט:ד-ז

(ד) כֹּה אָמַר ה' צְבָאוֹת אֱלֹהֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל  
לְכֹל־הַגּוֹלָה אֲשֶׁר־הִגַּלְתִּי מִירוּשָׁלַם  
בְּבָבֶלָה: (ה) בְּנֵוּ בָתִּים וְשִׁבוּ וְנִטְעוּ גִזְעוֹת  
וְאָכְלוּ אֶת־פְּרִיָן: (ו) קַחְו נָשִׁים וְהוֹלִידוּ  
בָנִים וּבָנוֹת וְקַחְו לְבָנֵיכֶם נָשִׁים וְאֶת־  
בָּנוֹתֵיכֶם תִּנּוּ לְאִנּוּשִׁים וְתִלְדְנָה בָנִים  
וּבָנוֹת וּרְבוּ־שָׁם וְאַל־תִּמְעָטוּ: (ז)  
וְדַרְשׂוּ אֶת־שְׁלוֹם הָעִיר אֲשֶׁר הִגַּלְתִּי  
אֶתְכֶם שָׁמָּה וְהִתְפַּלְלוּ בְעַדָּהּ אֶל־ה' כִּי  
בְשָׁלוֹמָה יִהְיֶה לָכֶם שְׁלוֹם: (פ)



Isaiah 49:5-6

(5) And now the LORD has resolved— He who formed me in the womb to be His servant— To bring back Jacob to Himself, That Israel may be restored to Him. And I have been honored in the sight of the LORD, My God has been my strength. (6) For He has said: “It is too little that you should be My servant In that I raise up the tribes of Jacob And restore the survivors of Israel: I will also make you a light of nations, That My salvation may reach the ends of the earth.”

ישעיהו מ"ט:ה-ו

(ה) וְעַתָּה אֶמַר יְהוָה יִצְרֵי מִבֶּטֶן  
לְעֶבֶד לֹא לְשׁוּבָב יַעֲקֹב אֱלֹהֵי וְיִשְׂרָאֵל  
לֹא [לוֹ] יֵאָסֵף וְאֶכְבֵּד בְּעֵינֵי יְהוָה  
וְאֵלֹהֵי הָיָה עֵי: (ו) וַיֹּאמֶר נְקִל  
מִהַיּוֹתֶיךָ לִי עֶבֶד לְהַקִּים אֶת־שִׁבְטֵי  
יַעֲקֹב וּנְצִירֵי [וּנְצִירֵי] יִשְׂרָאֵל לְהַשִּׁיב  
וּנְתִיבָהּ לְאֹר גּוֹיִם לְהַיִּית יְשׁוּעָתִי  
עַד־קְצֵה הָאָרֶץ: (ס)

## Micah 4:2-5

(2) And the many nations shall go and shall say:  
“Come, Let us go up to the Mount of the LORD, /  
To the House of the God of Jacob; / That God may  
instruct us in God’s ways, / And that we may walk in  
God’s paths.” / *For instruction shall come forth from  
Zion, / The word of the LORD from Jerusalem.* (3)  
Thus God will judge among the many peoples, / And  
arbitrate for the multitude of nations, / However  
distant; / And they shall beat their swords into  
plowshares / And their spears into pruning hooks. /  
Nation shall not take up / Sword against nation; /  
They shall never again know war; (4) But *every  
person shall sit / Under their grapevine or fig tree /  
And no one shall make them tremble.* / For it was the  
LORD of Hosts who spoke. (5) Though all the  
peoples walk / Each in the names of its gods, / We  
will walk / In the name of the LORD our God /  
Forever and ever.

## מיכה ד': ב'-ה'

(ב) וְהָלְכוּ גוֹיִם רַבִּים וְאָמְרוּ לָכֵן | וְנַעֲלֶה אֶל־הַר־ה' |  
וְאֶל־בַּיִת אֱלֹהֵי יַעֲקֹב וְיִוְרְנוּ מִדְּרָכָיו וְנִלְכֶה בְּאַרְחֻתָּיו כִּי  
מִצִּיּוֹן תֵּצֵא תוֹרָה וּדְבַר־ה' מִירוּשָׁלַם: (ג) וְשִׁפְט בֵּין  
עַמִּים רַבִּים וְהוֹכִיחַ לְגוֹיִם עֲצָמִים עַד־רָחֹק וְכַתְּתוּ  
חַרְבֵי־הֵמָּה לְאַתִּים וְחַנִּיתֵיהֶם לְמִזְמֵרוֹת לְא־יִשְׂרָאֵל גְּוִי  
אֶל־גּוֹי תִּקְרַב וְלֹא־יִלְמְדוּן עוֹד מִלְחָמָה: (ד) וְיִשְׁבּוּ אִישׁ  
תַּחַת גִּפְנוֹ וְתַחַת תְּאֲנָתוֹ וְאֵין מִחַרֵּיד כִּי־פִי ה' צָבָאוֹת  
דִּבֶּר: (ה) כִּי כָל־הָעַמִּים יִלְכוּ אִישׁ בְּשֵׁם אֱלֹהָיו וְאֲנִחְנוּ  
נִלְכֶה בְּשֵׁם־ה' אֱלֹהֵינוּ לְעוֹלָם וָעֶד: (פ)

## Theodore Herzl, "The Jewish State" (Der Judenstadt), 1896

We have sincerely tried everywhere to merge with the national communities in which we live, seeking only to preserve the faith of our fathers. It is not permitted us. In vain are we loyal patriots, sometimes super-loyal; in vain do we make the same sacrifices of life and property as our fellow citizens; in vain do we strive to enhance the fame of our native lands in the arts and sciences, or her wealth by trade and commerce. In our native lands where we have lived for centuries we are still decried as aliens, often by men whose ancestors had not yet come at a time when Jewish sighs had long been heard in the country..

Let me repeat once more my opening words: The Jews who will it shall achieve their State. We shall live at last as free men on our own soil, and in our own homes peacefully die. The world will be liberated by our freedom, enriched by our wealth, magnified by our greatness. And whatever we attempt there for our own benefit will redound mightily and beneficially to the good of all mankind.

## Louis Brandeis, “The Jewish Problem: How to Solve It,” excerpt

From: Paul Mendes-Flohr and Jehuda Reinharz, eds., *The Jew in the Modern World: A Documentary History*, 2nd ed., 496

Let no American imagine that Zionism is inconsistent with Patriotism. Multiple loyalties are objectionable only if they are inconsistent. A man is a better citizen of the United States for being also a loyal citizen of his state, and of his city; for being loyal to his family, and to his profession or trade; for being loyal to his college or his lodge. Every Irish American who contributed towards advancing home rule was a better man and a better American for the sacrifice he made. Every American Jew who aids in advancing the Jewish settlement in Palestine, though he feels that neither he nor his descendants will ever live there, will likewise be a better man and a better American for doing so.

...

America’s fundamental law seeks to make real the brotherhood of man. That brotherhood became the Jewish fundamental law more than twenty-five hundred years ago. America’s insistent demand in the twentieth century is for social justice. That also has been the Jews’ striving for ages. Their affliction as well as their religion has prepared the Jews for effective democracy. Persecution broadened their sympathies. It trained them in patient endurance, in self-control, and in sacrifice. It made them think as well as suffer. It deepened the passion for righteousness.

Indeed, loyalty to America demands rather that each American Jew become a Zionist. For only through the ennobling effect of its strivings can we develop the best that is in us and give to this country the full benefit of our great inheritance. The Jewish spirit, so long preserved, the character developed by so many centuries of sacrifice, should be preserved and developed further, so that in America as elsewhere the sons of the race may in future live lives and do deeds worthy of their ancestors.

**Mijal Bitton, “I’m a Sephardic Latina with an Intersectional Identity. That’s Why I Oppose the Women’s March,” *The Forward*, Jan. 15, 2019 (cont.)**

I write to help explain why I am not marching, why my identity, which otherwise fits in within the intersectional fight for common liberation and for women’s rights, informs my refusal to participate in a movement led by individuals who have contributed to the normalization of anti-Semitic discourse, and who have yet, despite recent apologies, to regain the trust of many in the Jewish community in this issue, myself included. ...

I write to express that there are feminist Jewish women, Jews of color, Hispanic Jews, Jewish immigrants, Mizrahi Jews, Sephardic Jews, Jews from Arab lands and others Jews with intersectional and marginalized identities who are making a conscientious choice to not join in the Women’s March, a decision partly informed by their own experiences of vulnerability and motivated by a determination to fight oppression through other means.

My commitment to upholding anti-Semitism as a moral red line which determines who I will partner with was not awakened, as it was for some American Jews, by the terrible attack in Pittsburgh. While the shooting at Tree of Life synagogue stands out as the most deadly anti-Semitic attack on American soil, observers attuned to the experiences of other, smaller, Jewish communities around the world know that the post-Holocaust resurgence of anti-Semitism (if it ever went away) has older, more pervasive and more complex global manifestations.

My political understanding of liberatory intersectionality includes not only Americans who suffer gender, racial, economic and other forms of inequalities, but also Jews around the world still facing one of the oldest forms of hatred that human history has witnessed.

I write this, then, to challenge the dichotomy that has already begun to emerge, a dichotomy that posits an “either/or” worldview in which individuals who refuse to march in this particular Women’s Movement are portrayed as not caring for social or racial justice.

I care. It is because I care that I am praying with my feet and marching away from the Women’s March.

Berakhot 11a:19-23

**Rav Yehezkel taught: One who acted in accordance with Beit Shammai has acted appropriately and is not in violation of the *halakha*. One who acted in accordance with the opinion of Beit Hillel acted appropriately as well. However, Rav Yosef said: One who acts in accordance with the opinion of Beit Shammai has done nothing and is worthless...**

**Rav Naḥman bar Yitzḥak stated: One who acted in accordance with Beit Shammai has acted so egregiously that he is liable to receive the death penalty, as we learned in our mishna that Rabbi Tarfon said: Once, I was coming on the road when I stopped and reclined to recite *Shema* in accordance with the statement of Beit Shammai. Yet in so doing, I endangered myself due to the highwaymen who accost travelers. The Sages said to him: You deserved to be liable to pay with your life, as you transgressed the statement of Beit Hillel.**

ברכות י"א א:י"ט-כ"ג

תני רב יחזקאל: עשה כדברי בית שמאי — עשה,  
כדברי בית הלל — עשה. רב יוסף אמר: עשה כדברי  
בית שמאי — לא עשה ולא כלום. ...

רב נחמן בר יצחק אמר: עשה כדברי בית שמאי —  
חייב מיתה. דתנו, אמר רבי טרפון: אני הייתי בא בדרך  
והייתי לקרות כדברי בית שמאי וסכנתי בעצמי מפני  
הלסטים, אמרו לו: כדאי היית לחוב בעצמך, שעברת  
על דברי בית הלל.

# Two Homes



## Multiple Homes: Ancient Feature of Jewish Belonging

### Philo of Alexandria, *Flaccus*

For no one country can contain the whole Jewish nation, by reason of its populousness; on which account they frequent all the most prosperous and fertile countries of Europe and Asia, whether islands or continents, looking indeed upon the holy city as their metropolis in which is erected the sacred temple of the most high God, but accounting those regions which have been occupied by their fathers, and grandfathers, and great grandfathers, and still more remote ancestors, in which they have been born and brought up, as their country.





# From No Homes to Two Homes

The Jewish People are the **story** we tell about ourselves.

Do we need a new grand narrative, a new meta-story, of Jewish Peoplehood today?

What happens if we have two stories?



# At-Homeness

Judaism is a story of “journey” rather than “arrival.”

How do the Jewish people come home?

What does it feel like?

How does it obligate us?

How do we deal with the fact that we have arrived at home both in Israel and North America?



SHALOM HARTMAN מכון  
INSTITUTE הרטמן שלום

---

**What can/should give?**

## Yehuda Kurtzer, Four Principles

1. Mutual thriving (our fates are tied together)
2. At-homeness is not a ZERO-SUM game (home *and* homeland)
3. No equal standing in both places
4. Do not waste this moment in history!



## Donniel Hartman

Israel needs to  
change its  
narrative.

“We are too often  
functioning within the  
one-home paradigm of  
a singular family with  
young children.”



# Principles of Multiple Homes

If Israel is to fulfill its responsibility as a homeland, it must make World Jewry feel at home.

That does not mean that World Jewry should have a vote on Israeli policies.

However, they need to see a space where they feel welcomed, respected, and valued.

***North American Jews need to exercise self-restraint.*** They need to hear what Israelis feel and take into account how they want to conduct life in their home.

We need to ***relinquish the hierarchical assumptions*** that each of us often has toward the other, that our home is the principal home, the better home, the more modern home.



---

**Our at-homeness**

# Together & Apart

Together and Apart is not a new phenomenon in Jewish history.

Jews were always together and apart!

“Together and Apart” is an *aspiration*, a call to build a strong sense of Jewish peoplehood which can be together in a meaningful way, despite our being apart in so many other ways.



SHALOM HARTMAN מכון  
INSTITUTE שלום הרטמן



## Donniel Hartman

*“The Jewish people are healthier, stronger, and more vibrant when the Covenant of Being and Becoming dance together.”*

This dance is not merely the story of Jewish peoplehood over the ages, but a blueprint for our future.”



SHALOM HARTMAN מכון  
INSTITUTE שלום הרטמן

# A Proposal for Using the Models to Heal

## ***Chevruta***

Friendship lived as covenantal partnership with deep respect, loving rebuke, and lasting commitment.



## **Pluralism**

A shared belief to frame how *chevruta* engages in other beliefs (e.g., Zionism, social justice, etc.)



## **A New “Family”**

We recognize our differences, take time to understand each other, and—even if we don’t like each other—we sit together at the table.



## **Multi-Family Homes**

We act like multiple generations each with their own home making room for family to feel at-home. Ideally, grandchildren are fully at home in each home.

## Is it possible to choose between 'Jewishness' and Israel? ELLIOT COSGROVE MARCH 9, 2021 06:55

I believe in a vibrant and dynamic expression of Judaism, one that is capable of inspiring our children and grandchildren in the faith of our ancestors. ...

I also believe that to be a Jew today is to live with Israel as a central pillar to my religious life. Some choose to live in Israel, some do not, but to not put one's engagement, concern and support for Israel, the sole sovereign Jewish state and home to half of world Jewry at the forefront of one's Judaism is to abdicate what it means to be a Jew. I could no sooner abandon my commitment to Israel as I could my commitment to prayer, mitzvot, Torah study or tikkun olam. ...

And yet, it would seem, I am being asked to choose.

I read the headlines coming out of Israel and feel that Diaspora Jewry is being told to choose between two essential aspects of our identities – our Jewish lives or our support for the State of Israel. It is a choice made all the more tortured because it is by way of my Judaism that our support for the State of Israel is derived. I don't expect everyone to agree with me; at my core I am also a pluralist – everyone is entitled to their opinion. And yet I wonder if the leadership of Israel does not understand the consequences of their actions.

Do they not know that 85% of AIPAC's membership is constituted by self-identifying Reform and Conservative Jews? Have they not considered that it is not the smartest thing to **call us dogs and clowns** at the very moment the Biden administration is looking to rejoin the Iran nuclear deal? **At the very moment that non-Orthodox American Jews are being asked to stand in the breach against the forces of BDS, defending Israel in the court of public opinion, is this really the moment you want to tell us that you don't believe we, our children and grandchildren are Jewish?!**

**"How can I,"** as one of my colleagues lamented, **"fight against the delegitimization of Israel when the government of Israel delegitimizes me."** The recent rhetoric out of Israel is injudicious for a variety of tactical reasons. But most of all it is just downright wrong. For one Jew to demonize another is antithetical to every Jewish value I know, a knife at the heart of the Jewish people, and of deep personal offense to millions of American Jews.

Shver tsu zayn a yid. It's hard to be a Jew. Blessed as we are to live in a time of a strong State of Israel and Diaspora Jewry, it can be hard to negotiate all the competing pulls on our Jewish souls. To my brothers and sisters in Israel, would it be too much to ask you to lend a hand and help me lighten my load and lift us all up higher? If it is a whipping boy you need, pick on Iran, pick on COVID, pick on the oil spill wreaking environmental havoc on Israel's seashore. **Pick on any number of challenges facing Israel – just not on your own brother. After all, we have a long journey ahead of us, and I know, and I would like to think somewhere deep down you also know, that the only way we will get there is if we do so together.**

## Israel Elections: Why I'm voting for Yair Lapid - opinion

YOSSI KLEIN HALEVI MARCH 11, 2021 20:18

The centrist vision begins with Israel's Declaration of Independence. The framers insisted on an Israel at once Jewish and democratic: **the state of all Jews, whether or not they are its citizens**; the state of all of its citizens, whether or not they are Jews. Through Israel's formative years, this definition was self-evident to both right-wing and left-wing Israelis. David Ben-Gurion's Labor Party was committed to Israel as a Jewish state, and Menachem Begin's Likud was committed to Israel as a democratic state.

In recent years, though, this foundational entwining of Jewish and democratic identities has been under increasing assault. Lapid has defined defending the integrity of Jewish and democratic Israel as the core of the centrist mission.

THAT MISSION means ensuring that all parts of Israeli society, including the Arab minority, are treated as shareholders in the country's future. It also means **ensuring that all parts of the Diaspora remain connected to Israel. A Jewish state is not the same as a Jewish community; it doesn't belong to any one part of the Jewish people. The Israeli public space must reflect the totality of the Jewish experience; official Judaism cannot be entrusted to a single gatekeeper. To do so negates the Zionist commitment to Jewish peoplehood. ...**

I've spent much of my life as an Israeli voter being frustrated by one failed centrist party after another. Yesh Atid is the first centrist party that has proven its staying power – its ideological consistency and its ability to build a camp of devoted voters.

Finally, I'm voting for Yair Lapid because he's proven himself to be that rarest of Israeli politicians: a **mensch**. Compare his tone to other candidates: He focuses on the issues, avoids cheap shots, insists on treating us like grown-ups.

---

## Recommended Materials

- [Full text of Elliot Cosgrove op-ed](#)
- [Elliot Cosgrove full sermon](#)
- [Full text of Yossi Klein Halevi op-ed](#)

## Recommended Continuity

- [For Heaven's Sake](#) podcast
- [Identity/Crisis](#) podcast