



taught by Rabbi Jeremy Winaker



# Agenda for February 21, 2021

- I. Welcome
- II. Which nationalism is harder for you to articulate?
- III. Anti-Semitism
  - A. Definitions
  - B. Us-Them Sources
- IV. Peoplehood and Boundaries of Difference
  - A. Sources
  - B. Categories
- V. Contemporary Anti-Semitism
  - A. Right-Left
    - 1. Historically
    - 2. Today
  - B. What to Do?
- VI. Between Now and Next Class
  - A. Recommended Materials
  - B. Experience Purim with an eye on joy not fear



# Syllabus

## Part I: Stories of Jewish Peoplehood

Unit 1: From No Home to Two Homes

Unit 2: Judaism of Being

Unit 3: Judaism of Becoming

Unit 4: On Universalism and Particularism

## Part II: Contemporary Challenges to Jewish Peoplehood

Unit 5: Between Nationalism, Ultra-Nationalism, and Fascism

Unit 6: Moral Implications of Jewish Nationalism

Unit 7: Israel's Nation-State Law: Ramifications for a Jewish and Democratic State

Unit 8: Antisemitism as a Divisive Force

Unit 9: Antisemitism and Anti-Zionism

Unit 10: The Accusation and Dilemma of Dual Loyalties

Unit 11: "What's Good for the Jews?" Identity Politics in North America

## Part I: Jewish Peoplehood

January 3: Introduction From No Home to Two Homes

January 17: Judaism as Ethics *and* Beliefs  
(Units 2 & 3)

January 24: On Universalism and Particularism

## Part II: Challenges to Jewish Peoplehood

February 15\*: Nationalism  
(Units 5, 6, & 7)

February 21: Antisemitism  
(Units 8 & 9)

February 28 Dual Loyalties and Identity Politics  
(Units 10 & 11)



# Syllabus (cont.)

## Part III: New Relationship Models for Jewish Peoplehood

Unit 12: From Family to Consumer

Unit 13: Shared Believers, Partners, and Investors

Unit 14: At-Homeness

## Part III: New Models of Peoplehood

March 7: Models to Consider  
(Units 12 & 13)

March 14: At-Home-ness

---

**President Trump  
is not an anti-  
Semite...**

**He traffics with them.**

**Rep. Ilhan Omar  
is not an anti-  
Semite...**

**She expresses  
anti-Semitic tropes.**

# Defining Anti-Semitism

Donniel Hartman's minimal definition: “The vilification of Jews qua Jews.”

Yossi Klein Halevi's red line definition: “Lethal Jew hatred”



# Defining Anti-Semitism

Natan Sharansky, “3D Test of Anti-Semitism: Demonization, Double Standards, Delegitimization,” *Jewish Political Studies Review* 16 (Fall 2004), 3-4

Demonization: “when Israel’s actions are blown out of all sensible proportion...”

Double Standards: “when criticism of Israel is applied selectively...”

Delegitimization: “when Israel’s fundamental right to exist is denied...”

International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA)’s Working definition:

“Antisemitism is a certain perception of Jews, which may be expressed as hatred toward Jews. Rhetorical and physical manifestations of antisemitism are directed toward Jewish or non-Jewish individuals and/or their property, toward Jewish community institutions and religious facilities.” [examples given]



---

# Sources on Jews as Other

## Exodus 1:7-12

(7) But the Israelites were fertile and prolific; they multiplied and increased very greatly, so that the land was filled with them. (8) A new king arose over Egypt who did not know Joseph. (9) And he said to his people, **“Look, the Israelite people are much too numerous for us. (10) Let us deal shrewdly with them, so that they may not increase; otherwise in the event of war they may join our enemies in fighting against us** and rise from the ground.” (11) So they set taskmasters over them to oppress them with forced labor; and they built garrison cities for Pharaoh: Pithom and Raamses. (12) But the more they were oppressed, the more they increased and spread out, so that the [Egyptians] came to dread the Israelites.

## שמות א':ז-י"ב

(ז) ובני ישראל פָּרוּ וַיִּשְׂרְצוּ וַיִּרְבוּ וַיַּעֲצְמוּ בְּמֵאֵד מְאֹד  
וַתִּמְלֵא הָאָרֶץ אֹתָם: (ח) (פ) וַיָּקָם מֶלֶךְ-חָדָשׁ עַל-מִצְרָיִם  
אֲשֶׁר לֹא-יָדַע אֶת-יֹסֵף: (ט) וַיֹּאמֶר אֶל-עַמּוֹ הַזֶּה עִם בְּנֵי  
יִשְׂרָאֵל רַב וְעָצוּם מִמֶּנּוּ: (י) הֲבֵי נִתְחַכְמָה לּוֹ פֶּן-יִרְבּוּ  
וְהָיָה כִּי-תִקְרָאנָה מִלְחָמָה וְנוֹסַף גַּם-הוּא עַל-שְׂנְאֵינוּ  
וְנִלְחַם-בָּנוּ וְעָלָה מִזֶּה-הָאָרֶץ: (יא) וַיַּשְׁיִמוּ עָלָיו שָׂרֵי מִסִּים  
לְמַעַן עֲנֹתוֹ בְּסִבְלָתָם וַיִּבְנוּ עָרֵי מִסְכְּנוֹת לְפָרְעֹה אֶת-פִּתּוֹם  
וְאֶת-רַעַמְסֵס: (יב) וַכֹּאשֶׁר יַעֲנֶנּוּ אֹתוֹ כֵּן יִרְבֶּה וְכֵן יִפְרֹץ  
וַיִּקְצוּ מִפְּנֵי בְנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל:

## Numbers 23:9-11

(9) As I see them from the mountain tops, Gaze on them from the heights, **There is a people that dwells apart, Not reckoned among the nations, (10) Who can count the dust of Jacob, Number the dust-cloud of Israel?** May I die the death of the upright, May my fate be like theirs! (11) Then Balak said to Balaam, “What have you done to me? Here I brought you to damn my enemies, and instead you have blessed them!”

## במדבר כ"ג:ט-י"א

(ט) כִּי־מֵרָאשׁ צָרִים אֲרֹאֲנוּ וּמִגְּבֻעוֹת  
אֲשַׁנְּרֵנוּ הֲוֹעֵם לְבָדָד יִשְׁפֹּן וּבְגוֹיִם לֹא  
יִתְחַשֵּׁב: (י) מִי מִנָּה עֵפֶר יַעֲקֹב  
וּמִסָּפֵר אֶת־רִבְעֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל תִּמְתַּת נַפְשִׁי  
מוֹת יִשְׂרָיִם וּתְהִי אַחֲרֵי־יָמַי כְּמֹהוּ: (יא)  
וַיֹּאמֶר בָּלָק אֶל־בְּלָעָם מָה עָשִׂיתָ לִּי  
לְקַב אִיבִי לְקַח־תִּיךָ וְהִנֵּה בִּרְכַתְּ בָרַךְ:

(5) When Haman saw that Mordecai would not kneel or bow low to him, Haman was filled with rage. (6) But he disdained to lay hands on Mordecai alone; having been told who Mordecai's people were, Haman plotted to do away with all the Jews, Mordecai's people, throughout the kingdom of Ahasuerus. (7) In the first month, that is, the month of Nisan, in the twelfth year of King Ahasuerus, pur—which means “the lot”—was cast before Haman concerning every day and every month, [until it fell on] the twelfth month, that is, the month of Adar. (8) Haman then said to King Ahasuerus, **“There is a certain people, scattered and dispersed among the other peoples in all the provinces of your realm, whose laws are different from those of any other people and who do not obey the king’s laws; and it is not in Your Majesty’s interest to tolerate them. (9) If it please Your Majesty, let an edict be drawn for their destruction, and I will pay ten thousand talents of silver to the stewards for deposit in the royal treasury.”**

(ה) וַיֵּרָא הָמָן כִּי־אִין מְרַדְכַי כִּרְע וּמִשְׁתַּחֲוֶה לּוֹ וַיִּמְלֵא  
הָמָן חֲמָה: (ו) וַיִּבֹז בְּעֵינָיו לְשַׁלַּח יָד בְּמֶרְדֵּכַי לְבַדּוֹ כִּי־  
הִגִּידוּ לוֹ אֶת־עַם מְרַדְכַי וַיִּבְקֹשׁ הָמָן לְהַשְׁמִיד אֶת־כָּל־  
הַיְהוּדִים אֲשֶׁר בְּכָל־מְלָכוֹת אַחַשְׁוֵרוּשׁ עִם מְרַדְכַי: (ז)  
בַּחֹדֶשׁ הָרִאשׁוֹן הוּא־הַחֹדֶשׁ נִסָּן בְּשָׁנַת שְׁתַּיִם עֶשְׂרִיהַ לְמֶלֶךְ  
אַחַשְׁוֵרוּשׁ הַפִּיל פּוֹרֶה הוּא הַגּוֹרֵל לְפָנָי הָמָן מִיּוֹם ׀ לַיּוֹם  
וּמִחֹדֶשׁ לְחֹדֶשׁ שְׁנַיִם־עָשָׂר הוּא־הַחֹדֶשׁ אָדָר: (ח) (ח)  
וַיֹּאמֶר הָמָן לְמֶלֶךְ אַחַשְׁוֵרוּשׁ יִשְׁנֹו עִם־אַחַד מִפְּזָר  
וּמִפְּרָד בֵּין הָעַמִּים בְּכָל מְדִינֹות מְלָכוֹתְךָ וְדַתֵּיהֶם שְׁנוֹת  
מִכָּל־עַם וְאֶת־דַּתִי הַמְּלֹדֶה אֵינָם עוֹשִׂים וְלִמְלַךְ אִין־שׁוּה  
לְהַנִּיחָם: (ט) אִם־עַל־הַמְּלַךְ טוֹב יִכְתֹּב לְאַבְדָּם וְעֲשֶׂרֶת  
אַלְפִים כֶּכֶר־כֶּסֶף אֲשֶׁקוּל־עַל־יְדֵי עֹשֵׂי הַמְּלֶאכָה לְהַבִּיא  
אֶל־גִּנְזֵי הַמְּלַךְ:

## Pesach Haggadah, Magid

And it is this that has stood for our ancestors and for us; since **it is not [only] one [person or nation] that has stood [against] us to destroy us, but rather in each generation, they stand [against] us to destroy us**, but the Holy One, blessed be He, rescues us from their hand.

## Pesach Haggadah, Pour Out Thy Wrath

Pour your wrath upon the nations that did not know You and upon the kingdoms that did not call upon Your Name! Since they have consumed Ya'akov and laid waste his habitation (Psalms 79:6-7). Pour out Your fury upon them and the fierceness of Your anger shall reach them (Psalms 69:25)! You shall pursue them with anger and eradicate them from under the skies of the Lord (Lamentations 3:66).

## הגדה של פסח, מגיד

וְהִיא שְׁעִמְדָּה לְאַבֹּתֵינוּ וְלָנוּ. שְׁלֹא  
אֶחָד בְּלִבָּד עָמַד עָלֵינוּ לְכַלּוֹתֵנוּ,  
אֲלָא שְׁבָכָל דּוֹר וָדוֹר עוֹמְדִים עָלֵינוּ  
לְכַלּוֹתֵנוּ, וְהַקְדוֹשׁ בְּרוּךְ הוּא מְצִילֵנוּ  
מִיָּדָם.

## הגדה של פסח, שפוך חמתך

שְׁפֹךְ חֲמַתְךָ אֶל־הַגּוֹיִם אֲשֶׁר לֹא יָדְעוּךָ וְעַל־  
מַמְלָכוֹת אֲשֶׁר בְּשִׁמְךָ לֹא קָרְאוּ. כִּי אָכַל אֶת־  
יַעֲקֹב וְאֶת־נְהוּוֹ הִשְׁמִי. שְׁפֹךְ־עָלֵיהֶם זַעַמְךָ וְחֲרוֹן  
אַפֶּךָ יִשָּׁגֶם. תִּרְדֹּף בְּאֵף וְתִשְׁמִידֵם מִתַּחַת שָׁמַי  
ה'.

### Yevamot 47a:13

**The Sages taught** in a *baraita*: With regard to a potential **convert who comes to a court in order to convert, at the present time**, when the Jews are in exile, the judges of the court **say to him: What did you see that motivated you to come to convert? Don't you know that the Jewish people at the present time are anguished, suppressed, despised, and harassed, and hardships are frequently visited upon them? If he says: I know, and although I am unworthy of joining the Jewish people and sharing in their sorrow, I nevertheless desire to do so, then the court accepts him immediately** to begin the conversion process.

### יבמות מ"ז א:י"ג

תנו רבנן גר שבא להתגייר בזמן הזה אומרים לו מה ראית שבאת להתגייר אי אתה יודע שישראל בזמן הזה דוויים דחופים סחופים ומטורפין ויסורין באין עליהם אם אומר יודע אני ואיני כדאי מקבלין אותו מיד

---

# Sources on boundaries of Jewish peoplehood

## Pesach Haggadah, The Four Sons

The wicked one, what do they say?  
"What is this service to you?" 'To  
you' and not 'to them.' **And since  
they excluded themselves from the  
collective, they are a heretic in  
the essence.** You, therefore, blunt  
his teeth and say to them, "It is  
because of this that the Lord did  
for *me* when I left Egypt." 'For me'  
but not 'for them.' If they had been  
there, they would not have been  
saved.

## הגדה של פסח, כנגד ארבעה בנים

רשע מָה הוא אומר? מָה הָעֲבוּדָה  
הזאת לָכֶם. לָכֶם – וְלֹא לֹ. וּלְפִי  
שְׁהוּצִיא אֶת עַצְמוֹ מִן הַכָּלָל כְּפֹר  
בְּעֵקֶר. וְאִם אַתָּה הִקְהֵה אֶת שְׁנֵי  
וְאָמַר לֹ: "בְּעִבוּר זֶה עָשָׂה ה' לִי  
בְּצֵאתִי מִמִּצְרָיִם". לִי וְלֹא־לֹ. אֱלוֹ  
הָיָה שָׁם, לֹא הָיָה נִגְאָל:

## Berakhot 10b

**MISHNA:** Beit Shammai and Beit Hillel disputed the proper way to recite *Shema*. **Beit Shammai say:** in the manner indicated in the text of *Shema* itself. **in the evening every person must recline and in the morning he must stand, as it is stated: “When you lie down, and when you rise.”** And **Beit Hillel say:** Every person recites *Shema* as he is, as it is stated: “And when you walk along the way.” If so, according to Beit Hillel, **why was it stated: “When you lie down, and when you rise”?** Merely to denote time: **at the time when people lie down and the time when people rise.** **Rabbi Tarfon said:** Once, I was coming on the road when I stopped and **reclined to recite *Shema* in accordance with the statement of Beit Shammai.** Yet in so doing, I **endangered myself due to the highwaymen [*listim*]** who accost travelers. The Sages **said to him: You deserved to be liable to pay with your life, as you transgressed the statement of Beit Hillel.**

## ברכות י' ב: ל"ז-מ"א

מתנניי בית שמאי אומרים: בערב — כל אדם יטה ויקרא. ובבקר יעמוד, שנאמר: “ובשכבך ובקומך”. ובית הלל אומרים: כל אדם קורא קורא כדרךכו. שנאמר “ובלקחתך בדרך”. אם כן למה נאמר “ובשכבך ובקומך” — בשעה שבני אדם שוכבים ובשעה שבני אדם עומדים. אמר רבי טרפון: אני הייתי בא בדרך והטיתי לקרות כדברי בית שמאי. וסכנתי בעצמי מפני הלסטים. אמרו לו: כדי היית לחוב בעצמך, שעברת על דברי בית הלל.

Berakhot 11a:19-23

**Rav Yehezkel taught:** One who acted in accordance with **Beit Shammai** has acted appropriately and is not in violation of the *halakha*. One who acted in accordance with the opinion of **Beit Hillel** acted appropriately as well. However, **Rav Yosef said:** One who acts in accordance with the opinion of **Beit Shammai** has done nothing and is worthless...

**Rav Nahman bar Yitzhak stated:** One who acted in accordance with **Beit Shammai** has acted so egregiously that he is liable to receive the death penalty, as we learned in our mishna that **Rabbi Tarfon said:** Once, I was coming on the road when I stopped and reclined to recite *Shema* in accordance with the statement of **Beit Shammai**. Yet in so doing, I endangered myself due to the highwaymen who accost travelers. The Sages said to him: You deserved to be liable to pay with your life, as you transgressed the statement of **Beit Hillel**.

ברכות י"א א:י"ט-כ"ג

תני רב יחזקאל: עשה כדברי בית שמאי — עשה, כדברי בית הלל — עשה. רב יוסף אמר: עשה כדברי בית שמאי — לא עשה ולא כלום. ...

רב נחמן בר יצחק אמר: עשה כדברי בית שמאי — חייב מיתה. דתנו, אמר רבי טרפון: אני הייתי בא בדרך והייתי לקרות כדברי בית שמאי וסכנתי בעצמי מפני הלסטים, אמרו לו: כדאי היית לחוב בעצמך, שעברת על דברי בית הלל.

## Chullin 5a:10-12

The Sages **stated: One accepts offerings from Jewish transgressors so that they will consequently repent, except for the apostate, one who pours wine as a libation to idolatry, and one who desecrates Shabbat in public. This baraita itself is self-contradictory.** Initially, **It said: “Of you,”** indicating: **But not all of you.** This serves to **exclude the apostate,** from whom an offering is not accepted. **And then the tanna teaches: One accepts offerings from Jewish transgressors.** The Gemara answers: **This is not difficult. The first clause** states that an offering is not accepted from **an apostate with regard to the entire Torah. The middle clause** states that one accepts an offering from **an apostate with regard to one matter.**

## חולין ה' א:י-י"ב

מכאן אמרו מקבלין קרבנות מפושעי ישראל כדי שיחזרו בהן בתשובה חוץ מן המומר ומנסך את היין ומחלל שבתות בפרהסיא הא גופא קשיא אמרת 'מכם' ולא כולכם להוציא את המומר והדר תני מקבלין קרבנות מפושעי ישראל הא לא קשיא רישא מומר לכל התורה כולה מציעתא מומר לדבר אחד



# Categories

# Boundaries within Judaism

Pluralism	Tolerance	Deviance
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Equally legitimate</li><li>• Valuable choice</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Wrong, Inferior Choice</li><li>• Respect others' freedom to choose "poorly"</li><li>• Others' choice poses no threat</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Unacceptable, Intolerable</li><li>• Harmful, dangerous</li></ul>
At the table	In the room	Not allowed in the room



# Boundaries around Deviance

Tolerable Deviance	Intolerable Deviance
Hate the behavior, not the person	“Cancel,” shun, excommunicate
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Apostasy in one matter</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Apostasy in all of Torah</li></ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Driving more than 75 mph</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• DWI or DUI</li></ul>



**Alana Newhouse, “American Yahrzeit,” *Tablet Magazine*, October 29, 2018**

...Many well-intentioned Americans, including many Jews, appear to have difficulty believing that anti-Semitism is unique and entirely unrelated to who Jews are or what they do. But it is. And to explain Bowers’ motives as anything other than the purest expression of the thought-virus he carried—as a political act, or an exercise in some other kind of applied reason—is to participate in the killer’s own sickness.

The widespread dismissal, on both the right and left, of the reality of anti-Semitism often shows a profound misunderstanding of what anti-Semitism is and how it operates. There are reasons for this misunderstanding, of course. There is the nature of anti-Semitism itself, which doesn’t fit easily into a contemporary conversation about prejudice rooted in American ideas about race, gender, and sexual orientation. There is political opportunism. There is fear. There is the widespread American ignorance of history, which comes from the belief that we, as Americans, exist outside of history, or are in the process of transcending history, in order to achieve a more perfect union with whatever form of the divine.

Among American Jews, there is also the fact that we are conditioned both by the American mythos and by our own history to think of anti-Semitism as something that happens there, rather than here...

People who argue that powerful people who consort with anti-Semites don’t mean it, or can’t be held responsible for their actions or alliances, are not our friends—whether they claim to represent the right or the left. They are the friends of people who want to kill us. Those who argue—from the right or the left—that anti-Semitism should be tolerated as part of a larger struggle against some much bigger force of darkness, those people are arguing for the tolerance of anti-Semitism, against the interests of our community...

**Deborah Lipstadt, “Jewish Myopia in a Perfect Storm of Antisemitism,” *Times of Israel*, January 27, 2019**

So why is today’s surge in Jew-hatred different – and particularly alarming? Generally, antisemitism has come from either the right or the left. But today, it comes from three different sides at the same time... To make all this worse, some Jews have politicized the fight against this torrent of hatred. Many are prone to see antisemitism only on the other side of the political transom, even as they fail to see it within their own camp.

---

**President Trump  
is not an anti-  
Semite...**

**He traffics with them.**

**Rep. Ilhan Omar  
is not an anti-  
Semite...**

**She expresses  
anti-Semitic tropes.**

---

**President Trump  
is not an anti-  
Semite...**

**He traffics with them.**

**Rep. Ilhan Omar  
is not an anti-  
Semite...**

**She expresses  
anti-Semitic tropes.**

---

## Recommended Materials

- **\* Pastoral Letter to Shir Tikvah (MN)**
- For more on pluralism vs tolerance vs deviance, sourcebook pages 171-182+
- For more on Soviet anti-Semitism, sourcebook pages 191-201
- On IHRA's working definition as law, podcast