SHALOM HARTMAN מכון
INSTITUTE שלום הרטמן

Temple Beth El
בית אל

taught by Rabbi Jeremy Winaker

Agenda for January 23, 2021

I. Welcome
II. “What in Judaism Challenges You” Sharing
III. Grounding our Ethics & Beliefs
    A. Biblical
    B. Halakhic (Legal)
    C. Zionist
IV. Ways to Dance
    A. Balance
    B. Conditional
    C. Synthesized
IV. Applications
V. Between Now and Next Class
    A. Recommended Materials
    B. Is it any easier to be a patriotic American than it is to be a pro-Israel Jew?

Syllabus

Part I: Stories of Jewish Peoplehood
Unit 1: From No Home to Two Homes
Unit 2: Judaism of Being
Unit 3: Judaism of Becoming
Unit 4: On Universalism and Particularism
Part II: Contemporary Challenges to Jewish Peoplehood
Unit 5: Between Nationalism, Ultra-Nationalism, and Fascism
Unit 6: Moral Implications of Jewish Nationalism
Unit 7: Israel's Nation-State Law: Ramifications for a Jewish and Democratic State
Unit 8: Antisemitism as a Divisive Force
Unit 9: Antisemitism and Anti-Zionism
Unit 10: The Accusation and Dilemma of Dual Loyalties
Unit 11: "What's Good for the Jews?" Identity Politics in North America

Part I: Jewish Peoplehood
January 9: Introduction From No Home to Two Homes

January 16: Judaism as Ethics *and* Beliefs
(Units 2 & 3)

January 23: On Universalism and Particularism

Part II: Challenges to Jewish Peoplehood
February 13: Nationalism
(Units 5, 6, & 7)

February 20: Antisemitism
(Units 8 & 9)

February 27: Dual Loyalties and Identity Politics
(Units 10 & 11)

Syllabus (cont.)

Part III: New Relationship Models for Jewish Peoplehood
Unit 12: From Family to Consumer
Unit 13: Shared Believers, Partners, and Investors
Unit 14: At-Homeness

Part III: New Models of Peoplehood
March 6: Models to Consider
(Units 12 & 13)

March 13: At-Home-ness

Sources

Genesis 1:27

(27) And God created humanity in God's image, in the image of God God created it; male and female God created them.

בראשית א׳:כ״ז

(כז) וַיִּבְרָא אֱלֹקִים | אֶת־הָאָדָם בְּצַלְמוֹ בְּצֶלֶם אֱלֹקִים בָּרָא אֹתוֹ זָכָר וּנְקֵבָה בָּרָא אֹתָם׃

Mishnah Sanhedrin 4:5

(5) **How does** the court **intimidate the witnesses in** giving **testimony for** cases of **capital law? ...** The court tells the witnesses: **Therefore, Adam was created alone, to teach you that anyone who destroys one soul (from the Jewish people) the verse ascribes him** blame **as if he destroyed an entire world**.
And, **anyone who sustains one soul (from the Jewish people), the verse ascribes him** credit **as if he sustained an entire world.**
The mishna cites another reason: **And due to** maintaining **peace among people, so** that one **person will not say to another: My father,** i.e., progenitor, **is greater than your father.**
And so that the heretics who believe in multiple gods **will not say: There are many authorities in Heaven,** and each created a different person. **And to tell of the greatness of the Holy One, Blessed be God, as** when **a person stamps several coins with one seal, they are all similar to each other. But the supreme King of kings, the Holy One, Blessed be God, stamped all people with the seal of the first Adam**, **and not one of them is similar to another. ...**

משנה סנהדרין ד׳:ה׳

(ה) כֵּיצַד מְאַיְּמִין אֶת הָעֵדִים עַל עֵדֵי נְפָשׁוֹת, ... לְפִיכָךְ נִבְרָא אָדָם יְחִידִי, לְלַמֶּדְךָ, שֶׁכָּל הַמְאַבֵּד נֶפֶשׁ אַחַת (מִיִּשְׂרָאֵל), מַעֲלֶה עָלָיו הַכָּתוּב כְּאִלּוּ אִבֵּד עוֹלָם מָלֵא.

וְכָל הַמְקַיֵּם נֶפֶשׁ אַחַת (מִיִּשְׂרָאֵל), מַעֲלֶה עָלָיו הַכָּתוּב כְּאִלּוּ קִיֵּם עוֹלָם מָלֵא.

וּמִפְּנֵי שְׁלוֹם הַבְּרִיּוֹת, שֶׁלֹּא יֹאמַר אָדָם לַחֲבֵרוֹ אַבָּא גָדוֹל מֵאָבִיךָ.

וְשֶׁלֹּא יְהוּ מִינִין אוֹמְרִים, הַרְבֵּה רָשֻׁיּוֹת בַּשָּׁמָיִם. וּלְהַגִּיד גְּדֻלָּתוֹ שֶׁל הַקָּדוֹשׁ בָּרוּךְ הוּא, שֶׁאָדָם טוֹבֵעַ כַּמָּה מַטְבְּעוֹת בְּחוֹתָם אֶחָד וְכֻלָּן דּוֹמִין זֶה לָזֶה, וּמֶלֶךְ מַלְכֵי הַמְּלָכִים הַקָּדוֹשׁ בָּרוּךְ הוּא טָבַע כָּל אָדָם בְּחוֹתָמוֹ שֶׁל אָדָם הָרִאשׁוֹן וְאֵין אֶחָד מֵהֶן דּוֹמֶה לַחֲבֵרוֹ. ...

Genesis 12:1-3

(1) The LORD said to Abram, “Go forth from your native land and from your father’s house to the land that I will show you. (2) I will make of you a great nation, And I will bless you; I will make your name great, And you shall be a blessing. (3) I will bless those who bless you And curse him that curses you; And all the families of the earth Shall bless themselves by you.”

בראשית י״ב:א׳-ג׳

(א) וַיֹּאמֶר ה׳ אֶל־אַבְרָם לֶךְ־לְךָ
מֵאַרְצְךָ וּמִמּוֹלַדְתְּךָ וּמִבֵּית אָבִיךָ אֶל־
הָאָרֶץ אֲשֶׁר אַרְאֶךָּ: (ב) וְאֶעֱשְׂךָ לְגוֹי
גָּדוֹל וַאֲבָרֶכְךָ וַאֲגַדְּלָה שְׁמֶךָ וֶהְיֵה
בְּרָכָה: (ג) וַאֲבָרֲכָה מְבָרְכֶיךָ וּמְקַלֶּלְךָ
אָאֹר וְנִבְרְכוּ בְךָ כֹּל מִשְׁפְּחֹת הָאֲדָמָה:

Genesis 18:17-26

(17) Now the LORD had said, “Shall I hide from Abraham what I am about to do, (18) *since Abraham is to become a great and populous nation and all the nations of the earth are to bless themselves by him? (19) For I have singled him out, that he may instruct his children and his posterity to keep the way of the LORD by doing what is just and right,* in order that the LORD may bring about for Abraham what He has promised him.”

בראשית י״ח:י״ז-כ״ו

(יז) וַה' אָמָר הַמְכַסֶּה אֲנִי מֵאַבְרָהָם אֲשֶׁר אֲנִי עֹשֶׂה:
(יח) וְאַבְרָהָם הָיוֹ יִהְיֶה לְגוֹי גָּדוֹל וְעָצוּם וְנִבְרְכוּ בוֹ כֹּל
גּוֹיֵי הָאָרֶץ: (יט) כִּי יְדַעְתִּיו לְמַעַן אֲשֶׁר יְצַוֶּה אֶת־בָּנָיו
וְאֶת־בֵּיתוֹ אַחֲרָיו וְשָׁמְרוּ דֶּרֶךְ ה' לַעֲשׂוֹת צְדָקָה וּמִשְׁפָּט
לְמַעַן הָבִיא ה' עַל־אַבְרָהָם אֵת אֲשֶׁר־דִּבֶּר עָלָיו:

Genesis 18:17-26

(20) Then the LORD said, “The outrage of Sodom and Gomorrah is so great, and their sin so grave! (21) I will go down to see whether they have acted altogether according to the outcry that has reached Me; if not, I will take note.” (22) The men went on from there to Sodom, while Abraham remained standing before the LORD. (23) Abraham came forward and said, “Will You sweep away the innocent along with the guilty? (24) What if there should be fifty innocent within the city; will You then wipe out the place and not forgive it for the sake of the innocent fifty who are in it? (25) Far be it from You to do such a thing, to bring death upon the innocent as well as the guilty, so that innocent and guilty fare alike. Far be it from You! Shall not the Judge of all the earth deal justly?” (26) And the LORD answered, “If I find within the city of Sodom fifty innocent ones, I will forgive the whole place for their sake.”

בראשית י״ח:י״ז-כ״ו

(כ) וַיֹּאמֶר ה׳ זַעֲקַת סְדֹם וַעֲמֹרָה כִּי־רָבָּה וְחַטָּאתָם כִּי
כָבְדָה מְאֹד: (כא) אֵרְדָה־נָּא וְאֶרְאֶה הַכְּצַעֲקָתָהּ הַבָּאָה
אֵלַי עָשׂוּ ׀ כָּלָה וְאִם־לֹא אֵדָעָה: (כב) וַיִּפְנוּ מִשָּׁם
הָאֲנָשִׁים וַיֵּלְכוּ סְדֹמָה וְאַבְרָהָם עוֹדֶנּוּ עֹמֵד לִפְנֵי ה׳: (כג)
וַיִּגַּשׁ אַבְרָהָם וַיֹּאמַר הַאַף תִּסְפֶּה צַדִּיק עִם־רָשָׁע: (כד)
אוּלַי יֵשׁ חֲמִשִּׁים צַדִּיקִם בְּתוֹךְ הָעִיר הַאַף תִּסְפֶּה וְלֹא־
תִשָּׂא לַמָּקוֹם לְמַעַן חֲמִשִּׁים הַצַּדִּיקִם אֲשֶׁר בְּקִרְבָּהּ: (כה)
חָלִלָה לְךָ מֵעֲשֹׂת ׀ כַּדָּבָר הַזֶּה לְהָמִית צַדִּיק עִם־רָשָׁע
וְהָיָה כַצַּדִּיק כָּרָשָׁע חָלִלָה לָּךְ הֲשֹׁפֵט כָּל־הָאָרֶץ לֹא
יַעֲשֶׂה מִשְׁפָּט: (כו) וַיֹּאמֶר ה׳ אִם־אֶמְצָא בִסְדֹם חֲמִשִּׁים
צַדִּיקִם בְּתוֹךְ הָעִיר וְנָשָׂאתִי לְכָל־הַמָּקוֹם בַּעֲבוּרָם:

Deuteronomy 10:12-19

(12) And now, O Israel, what does the LORD your God demand of you? Only this: to revere the LORD your God, to walk only in God's paths, to love God, and to serve the LORD your God with all your heart and soul, (13) keeping the LORD's commandments and laws, which I enjoin upon you today, for your good. (14) *Mark, the heavens to their uttermost reaches belong to the LORD your God, the earth and all that is on it! (15) Yet it was to your ancestors that the LORD was drawn in God's love for them, so that God chose you, their lineal descendants, from among all peoples—as is now the case.* (16) Cut away, therefore, the thickening about your hearts and stiffen your necks no more. (17) For the LORD your God is God supreme and Lord supreme, the great, the mighty, and the awesome God, who shows no favor and takes no bribe, (18) but upholds the cause of the fatherless and the widow, and befriends the stranger, providing him with food and clothing.— (19) You too must befriend the stranger, for you were strangers in the land of Egypt.

דברים י׳:י״ב-י״ט

(יב) וְעַתָּה יִשְׂרָאֵל מָה ה' אֱלֹקֶיךָ שֹׁאֵל מֵעִמָּךְ כִּי אִם־לְיִרְאָה
אֶת־ה' אֱלֹקֶיךָ לָלֶכֶת בְּכָל־דְּרָכָיו וּלְאַהֲבָה אֹתוֹ וְלַעֲבֹד אֶת־ה'
אֱלֹקֶיךָ בְּכָל־לְבָבְךָ וּבְכָל־נַפְשֶׁךָ: (יג) לִשְׁמֹר אֶת־מִצְוֹת ה'
וְאֶת־חֻקֹּתָיו אֲשֶׁר אָנֹכִי מְצַוְּךָ הַיּוֹם לְטוֹב לָךְ: (יד) הֵן לַה'
אֱלֹקֶיךָ הַשָּׁמַיִם וּשְׁמֵי הַשָּׁמָיִם הָאָרֶץ וְכָל־אֲשֶׁר־בָּהּ: (טו) רַק
בַּאֲבֹתֶיךָ חָשַׁק ה' לְאַהֲבָה אוֹתָם וַיִּבְחַר בְּזַרְעָם אַחֲרֵיהֶם בָּכֶם
מִכָּל־הָעַמִּים כַּיּוֹם הַזֶּה: (טז) וּמַלְתֶּם אֵת עָרְלַת לְבַבְכֶם
וְעָרְפְּכֶם לֹא תַקְשׁוּ עוֹד: (יז) כִּי ה' אֱלֹקֵיכֶם הוּא אֱלֹקֵי
הָאֱלֹקִים וַאדוֹשֵׁם הָאֲדֹנִים הָאֵל הַגָּדֹל הַגִּבֹּר וְהַנּוֹרָא אֲשֶׁר
לֹא־יִשָּׂא פָנִים וְלֹא יִקַּח שֹׁחַד: (יח) עֹשֶׂה מִשְׁפַּט יָתוֹם
וְאַלְמָנָה וְאֹהֵב גֵּר לָתֶת לוֹ לֶחֶם וְשִׂמְלָה: (יט) וַאֲהַבְתֶּם אֶת־
הַגֵּר כִּי־גֵרִים הֱיִיתֶם בְּאֶרֶץ מִצְרָיִם:

Micah 4:2-5

(2) And the many nations shall go and shall say: “Come, Let us go up to the Mount of the LORD, / To the House of the God of Jacob; / That God may instruct us in God’s ways, / And that we may walk in God’s paths.” / *For instruction shall come forth from Zion, / The word of the LORD from Jerusalem.* (3) Thus God will judge among the many peoples, / And arbitrate for the multitude of nations, / However distant; / And they shall beat their swords into plowshares / And their spears into pruning hooks. / Nation shall not take up / Sword against nation; / They shall never again know war; (4) But *every person shall sit / Under their grapevine or fig tree / And no one shall make them tremble.* / For it was the LORD of Hosts who spoke. (5) Though all the peoples walk / Each in the names of its gods, / We will walk / In the name of the LORD our God / Forever and ever.

מיכה ד׳:ב׳-ה׳

(ב) וְהָלְכוּ גוֹיִם רַבִּים וְאָמְרוּ לְכוּ ו וְנַעֲלֶה אֶל־הַר־ה׳
וְאֶל־בֵּית אֱלֹקֵי יַעֲקֹב וְיוֹרֵנוּ מִדְּרָכָיו וְנֵלְכָה בְּאֹרְחֹתָיו כִּי
מִצִּיּוֹן תֵּצֵא תוֹרָה וּדְבַר־ה׳ מִירוּשָׁלִָם: (ג) וְשָׁפַט בֵּין
עַמִּים רַבִּים וְהוֹכִיחַ לְגוֹיִם עֲצֻמִים עַד־רָחֹוק וְכִתְּתוּ
חַרְבֹתֵיהֶם לְאִתִּים וַחֲנִיתֹתֵיהֶם לְמַזְמֵרוֹת לֹא־יִשָּׂא גּוֹי
אֶל־גּוֹי חֶרֶב וְלֹא־יִלְמְדוּן עוֹד מִלְחָמָה: (ד) וְיָשְׁבוּ אִישׁ
תַּחַת גַּפְנוֹ וְתַחַת תְּאֵנָתוֹ וְאֵין מַחֲרִיד כִּי־פִי ה׳ צְבָאוֹת
דִּבֵּר: (ה) כִּי כָּל־הָעַמִּים יֵלְכוּ אִישׁ בְּשֵׁם אֱלֹקָיו וַאֲנַחְנוּ
נֵלֵךְ בְּשֵׁם־ה׳ אֱלֹקֵינוּ לְעוֹלָם וָעֶד: (פ)

Bava Metzia 71a:3

There are those **who teach that which Rav Huna** said in connection with **that which Rav Yosef taught:** The verse states: **“If you lend money to any of My people, even to the poor person who is with you”** (Exodus 22:24). The term “My people” teaches that if one of **My people,** i.e., a Jew, **and a gentile** both come to borrow money from you, **My people take precedence.** The term “the poor person” teaches that if **a poor person and a rich person** come to borrow money, **the poor person takes precedence.** And from the term: “Who is with you,” it is derived: If **your poor person,** meaning one of your relatives, **and** one of **the poor of your city** come to borrow money, **your poor person takes precedence.** If it is between one of **the poor of your city and** one of **the poor of another city, the** one of **the poor of your city takes precedence.**

בבא מציעא ע״א א:ג׳

איכא דמתני לה להא דרב הונא אהא דתני רב יוסף (שמות כב, כד) אם כסף תלוה את עמי את העני עמך עמי ונכרי עמי קודם עני ועשיר עני קודם ענייך ועניי עירך ענייך קודמין עניי עירך ועניי עיר אחרת עניי עירך קודמין

Background Reading: #2 Leon Pinsker, “Auto-Emancipation” (last two paragraphs);
#3 Theodore Herzl, “The Jewish State” (fourth paragraph, last three paragraphs);
#4 Ze’ev Jabotinsky, “The Social Question” (last three sentences)

Three Paradigms for the Universalism-Particularism “Dance”

1. Balance
2. Conditional
3. Synthesized

SHALOM HARTMAN INSTITUTE מכון שלום הרטמן

False Dichotomies and Stereotypes

Particularists = self-interested	Universalists = moral
Particularists = loyal; committed	Universalists = assimilated; unengaged

SHALOM HARTMAN מכון
INSTITUTE שלום הרטמן

Background Reading: #7 Ed Feinstein “All the Families of the Earth” (first four paragraphs plus three sentences)

Extending the Learning

Read how George Washington used Micah 4:4 in a letter to the Jewish community in Newport, RI: https://founders.archives.gov/documents/Washington/05-06-02-0135

Watch and/or read how Amanda Gorman used Micah 4:4 in her inauguration poem on January 20, 2021: https://www.cnbc.com/2021/01/20/amanda-gormans-inaugural-poem-the-hill-we-climb-full-text.html

Then look at Background Reading #14 Hilary Putnam "Must We Choose between Patriotism and Universal Reason" p. 82

Recommended Materials

- The full exchange (or at least #5 & #6) between Rabbis Gordis and Brous (sourcebook pages 66-70 or -82)